



**CSMW Meeting Minutes  
January 23, 2013  
10:00 AM – 1:00 PM  
San Francisco, CA**

**NEW ACTION ITEMS:**

- **Clif/Heather** - Develop a matrix/list of all sediment activities in CA and post on website
- **Susie/Heather** – follow-up with IWR regarding National Shoreline Management Study (how will report be used?)
- **John** - to follow up with Dilip on county Humboldt Bay sea level rise study.
- **Heather** – follow-up with ERDC regarding comments to depth of closure/beneficial reuse paper
- **Clif** – post economic report for Monterey Bay on CSMW website
- **ALL** – Send comments to Chris regarding **WCGA Dredging Study Proposal**
- **Heather** - follow-up with Steve regarding OMB B/C policy
- **Mark** – follow-up on potential for CSMW to give presentation to Coastal Commission
- **Topics for future meetings**
  - Curt Storlazzi – fine sediment in Santa Cruz Harbor
  - Regional Beach Sand Project II presentation (Kim to contact SANDAG/Chris Webb)
  - San Clemente Dam Removal (Jon Warrick/Sara Flores)
  - SPUR activities (Tamara/John to report)
  - Bob Guzza – nearshore wave model
  - Brenda Goeden – SF Bay CRSMP
  - Jon Warrick - Elwha Dam removal project
  - Coastal Conservancy Project Manager - Monitoring on San Clemente Dam removal project

**PREVIOUS ACTION ITEMS:**

- **Chris Potter** - Future agenda items/presentations for:
  - Revisit Crescent City RSM status; literature search and data collection efforts
- **Chris Potter**– Still need representation from
  - Ocean Science Trust – still working on a representative (?? To follow-up)
- **Chris Potter** – follow up on Klamath Dam removal process monitoring– Jon Warrick will follow-up
- **John Dingler** - Suggestions for CSMW forum for Del Norte discussion with new executive director; Chris contacted Harbor District; **John** will take this on with Richard Young.
- **Chris** – Follow-up with SWRCB regarding classification of clean sediments as pollutants in CA – ONGOING - Jon Bishop and Dominic Gregorio Gregorio (new State Water Board ocean wetlands chief)



- **Chris Potter/Susie Ming/Heather Schlosser** – Will reconvene the PPR subcommittee to discuss the RSM Top Ten Recommendations
- **Susie and John Dingler** will prepare a memo re: pros and cons of CSMW participating in funding LCP updates
- **Brenda** will alert Chris when draft Water Plan is available
- **Mark Johnsson** will check w/ Greg Benoit to see if Coastal Armoring layer will be updated

### COMPLETED ITEMS:

- **Nate** – follow up w/ Brian Ross on draft initial guidance paper re: Beneficial Use Re-Definitions
- Brad Damitz or Phil King present to CSMW - economic analysis of the Southern Monterey Bay study
- Chris – Representative from SWRWCB (Dominic Gregorio)
- **Chris** – check on need for State input on WRDA Bill per Sen. Boxer's statements Steve mentioned (through Howard Marlowe).
- **George, Steve, Chris, Jim, Jessie BurtonEvans, Eric Braun** – form subcommittee for dedicated West Coast Dredge availability white paper.
- 

---

### ❖ Welcome and Introductions (Chris Potter)

### ❖ Review of Action Items from 11/14/12 Meeting (Chris Potter)

- Still working on meeting minutes

### ❖ Updates: Federal Agencies

- USACE, LA District (Susie Ming/Heather Schlosser)
  - Encinitas/Solana Beach Study – EIS sent out for public review at the end of December. Upcoming public meetings on Feb 6 and 7. Feb 26<sup>th</sup> is the last day for comments to be received.
  - Pismo Beach – Jan 9<sup>th</sup> – received conditional approval from the Coastal Commission
  - National Shoreline Management Study
    - Last contact with the effort was regarding the economics analysis
    - CA assessment is on in draft form. Smaller group is reviewing draft before sending out to a larger audience (end of February).
    - 1971 shoreline study was basis for assessment
    - Systematic approach to sediment management is included
    - Want to make sure information is accurate.
    - Chris – How important is this document and how might it impact future projects?
      - Not sure exactly how this might be used.
      - How could this augment the Master Plan?

- Might there be an impact on budgeting?
        - **Susie/Heather to follow-up with IWR/HQ**
      - Comments to be finalized from smaller group by the end of this week, but comments from a larger audience will be welcome.
  - USACE, SF District (John Dingler)
    - Humboldt Dredged Material Management Plan (DMMP) – draft report is undergoing approval process with Division Commander
      - **John to follow up with Dilip on county Humboldt Bay sea level rise study.**
    - Ocean Beach – Nearshore placement site (SF-17) is undergoing approval process as a permanent disposal site (site is larger than demo site).
      - Hope to have in place by June.
      - Public review of document will commence soon.
      - Site will encompass entire outfall pipe.
      - Beach placement on Ocean Beach – undergoing approval process
      - Could SF-17 boundary move with sea level rise?
  - USEPA (Brian Ross)
    - Will have another draft soon.
    - Awaiting comments from ERDC. **Heather to follow-up.**
  - USGS (Jon Warrick)
    - Map series
    - Tijuana paper – Chris sent out to CSMW
    - USGS fact sheet on fine-grained material dispersal should be out soon.
    - Will be meeting with Kristin Goodrich next week to discuss publicizing results of Tijuana study
    - San Clemente Dam Removal (Coastal Conservancy project) – technical group putting together plan to determine how to study – **Sarah and/or Jon to organize presentation in March**
  - NPS (Tamara Williams)
    - SPUR is having a stakeholder meeting regarding Ocean Beach management framework
      - **Tamara/John will report at next meeting**
    - Tennessee Valley Beach – arch collapsed in December – Clif has photos
- ❖ **Update: Sediment Master Plan PM Report (Clif Davenport)**
- See PM Report (attached)
- ❖ **Updates: State Agencies and NGOs**
- Boating and Waterways (Kim Sterrett)
    - No money for RSM activities in the current state budget
    - SANDAG finished RBSP II in late December. Will be monitored (by Scripps) for the next couple of years. **Kim to ask SANDAG to give update at upcoming CSMW (March)**
  - Coastal Commission (Lesley Ewing/Mark Johnsson)

- Pismo - City issued themselves permits for 2 other permits. CCC has appealed those permits.
- Santa Cruz County – proposed work along East Cliff Drive
  - 400 ft. long seawall, want to backfill seawall with beach sand rather than imported material
  - Takes up quite a bit of beach space (2:1 slope)
  - Sculpted design with benches, mostly covered in the summer, but exposed in the winter
  - Purpose of seawall is unclear
- Other State Agencies
  - OPC (Sarah Flores)
    - Sea Level Rise Interim Guidance Document – will be updated with new National Academy of Science numbers. What to do with area north of Mendocino? Reasonable guidance dependent on type of structure being constructed (bathroom vs. hospital)
      - March 27<sup>th</sup> – presented at next meeting
    - The California Climate Readiness Strategy (CRS) 2013 is the update document to the 2009 Climate Adaptation Strategy. The CRS will address recommendations to SLR and will have a 45-day comment period within the first half of 2013
    - \$2.5M approved for grants for LCP updates that incorporate sea level rise (working with the SCC and Coastal Commission).
      - Working on criteria for selecting grantees
    - WCGA – Climate Change group, responding to call from NOAA for Regional Ocean Partnership projects
      - Proposal will be to develop decision support tools/better models to use LiDAR data (for CA) and/or collect data (for OR). Proposal submitted this week for work next fiscal year. Regional Data team will be developing a west coast portal
- NGOs
  - CMANC – working on 2014 budget recommendations

❖ **Presentation: Economic Analysis of Southern Monterey Bay (Phil King)**

- Methodology
  - Construction/Nourishment costs estimated
  - County parcel data modified to reflect market price
  - Structures/Infrastructure valued at replacement cost
  - Benefits
    - Recreational Benefits
    - Ecological Benefits
    - Economic Impacts
    - Tax Revenue Impacts
- CSBAT Model
  - Estimate benefit of dry beach width
- Ecosystem Services

- Costanza's Study in NJ is the best study to date to determine ecological value (1 acre shoreline habitat in NJ = \$40K)
- Reduced value to \$20K
- Present value of services is just over \$500K per acre using 3.5% discount rate
- Nourishment can also cause ecological damage and this was not estimated
- General Results
  - Ceasing sand mining would add enormous value
    - >\$700M in recreation and ecological benefits (over 100 years)
  - Much less reason to armor the coast which adds even more to cost
  - Nourishment is cost effective (but are there enough sand sources??)
  - Armoring strategies are not cost effective over these reaches
  - Managed retreat is superior to armoring over these entire reaches
- Conclusion
  - Study allows a look at Ecological and Recreational benefits and Property Loss due to erosion
  - Should help narrow down alternatives
  - Nourishment is a viable cost-effective option for dealing with coastal erosion and sea level rise.
- Questions:
  - Is there a big difference in value of managed retreat between public vs private land?
    - No, the big difference is between developed and undeveloped land.
  - Can you make recommendations based on various timeframes?
    - Yes, recommendations could be made based on timeframes.
  - In Marina reach, managed retreat was a more viable option than the other reaches, why?
    - Because the Marina reach has more undeveloped areas.
  - Does CSBAT model run within GIS?
    - It can, but was run separately in this case.
- **Clif will post report on CSMW website**

❖ **Discussion: WCGA Dredging Study Proposal (Chris Potter)**

- See Handout
- **All – send comments to Chris**

❖ **Presentation: WRDA and a California RSM Federal Authority (Gerald Comati)**

- Background – looking at ways to get more federal funding for beach projects
- Obstacles
  - RSM projects are difficult to deliver under existing Federal Authorizations
  - Existing authorities are cumbersome and time consuming
  - A single local sponsor cannot afford projects.
- Existing Authorities

- Section 204 – carry out projects in connection with Federal dredging authorities, limited to \$5M (Fed investment)
- Details of New Authority
  - Establish a new Fed-State management structure
  - Funded through Federal, State, Local and other grants
  - No Benefit to Cost analysis – basis for Project nominations will be the Regional CRSMPs
  - Use existing data – CCSTWS+CCSMP+Other
  - Allows integration with existing Authorities
- Typical Projects
  - All project will have regional application
  - Harbor (including small harbors) dredging and beneficial reuse. More flexibility in application. Re-purpose the Federal role.
  - Sediment release – dams and debris basins
  - Symbiotic relationships with watershed management districts
  - Implementation of innovative technologies for beach protection
  - Capture off-shore sand resources for beach nourishment
  - Environmental enhancements in coastal regions
- Progress
  - Met with USACE and coordinated with Institute for Water Resources
  - Language developed
- Next Steps
  - Formulate state support
  - Secure Senatorial and Congressional commitments to lead
  - Senatorial and Congressional chamber's Legislative Councils put WRDA language in final form
  - Secure support from subcommittees on Energy and Public Works and Transportation/Infrastructure
- Questions
  - Why only CA? Why not include the entire West Coast?
    - Issues vary greatly along the entire West Coast and it seemed to be too difficult to tackle.
  - Is there a Bill sponsor?
    - Not yet
  - There are existing projects that have difficulties in getting authorized, how would this authority be different?
  - Why is there no funding limits attached?
    - Consultants suggested not to attach a limit
  - Are there plans to enlist Congressional District beyond Capps?
    - Yes, other Congressional must be enlisted.
    - Sam Farr might be interested.
    - Need others that would be willing to support the effort.
  - Comments
    - Add language that ALL benefits could be included (i.e. don't cap recreation benefits)



❖ **Wrap-Up**

- OMB – B/C policy raised to 2.5:1 – **Heather to follow-up with Steve Aceti**
- **Proposal to change CSMW meetings to the 3<sup>rd</sup> Wednesday of the month**
- Abstracts for H2O are due February 4<sup>th</sup>
  - Should there be a public meeting at H2O?
- Suggestion given that CSMW should make a presentation to the Coastal Commission (**Mark to follow-up**)

**Next Meeting**  
**\*\*February 19<sup>th</sup> (Tuesday)\*\***  
**Phone Call**

## CSMW PM Report January 23, 2013

### A: Outreach

1. California Water Plan Update 2013, RSM Section- Meeting and webinar to discuss comments was held on Nov 20, 2012 in Sacramento. Restructure provided much better effort at incorporating CSMW efforts and coastal RSM, some issues remain
2. Beneficial Reuse White Paper- Brian is still waiting for additional comments from ERDC. Likely to be at least March before revised guidance document will be available.
3. CSMW letter to Gulf of Farrallones/Monterey Bay National Marine Sanctuary regarding “donut hole”
  - a. State extended technical assistance to the Sanctuary - Chris to follow-up.
  - b. Sanctuary and Corps to meet February 4<sup>th</sup>.
  - c. Public Notice is out on expansion to the north (to include all of Sonoma County)
4. A meeting with stakeholders in Morro Bay was held on Dec 5, 2012 to discuss sediment management in the area and to gage interest in a CRSMP for coastal San Luis Obispo County. Stakeholders were interested, needed to check with their management. Draft meeting minutes are being finalized and will be uploaded to website (Susie); Follow-up meeting will be scheduled with interested parties in February/March 2013
5. Stakeholder (Mr. Mark Stechbart) in SFOC CRSMP has raised conflict of interest issues WRT ESA/PWAs (Bob Battalio) involvement in plan development. Mr. Stechbart contacted John Dingler last Friday and was advised to submit a formal correspondence outlining his concerns.
  - a. Concern arose over including the Sharp Park Golf Course as part of a managed retreat scenario.

### B: Coastal RSM Plans:

1. Orange County- All comments on the public draft report are being incorporated and revisions are almost complete.
2. Santa Cruz littoral cell-
  - a. USACE is working with NOAA on interagency agreement for Monterey Bay Sanctuary oversight of the outreach and governance sections of the RSM Plan. Final draft of the MOA was provided to NOAA for their action (Brad Damitz slated to be outreach coordinator)
  - b. USACE (San Francisco District) has prepared a document summarizing the current scientific understanding of coastal processes in the study area, including a literature review. USACE is continuing collection and analysis of GIS data in order to identify critical infrastructure and Beach Erosion





Concern Areas. USACE will start the environmental coordination process as soon as the interagency agreement with NOAA is in place.

3. **SF Bay** - No update
4. **San Francisco Open Coast:**
  - a. Stakeholder and public meetings held in Pacifica to gather additional stakeholder and public input
  - b. ABAG is utilizing in-house expertise to examine what they need to do WRT CEQA in order for them to adopt the CRSMP when completed
5. **Eureka Littoral Cell-** Moffatt & Nichol are rewriting report to address CSMW comments on their preliminary administrative draft. John and Clif held phone call with Dilip to answer questions he had. Dilip has not responded to recent inquires about the status of the draft report
6. **Los Angeles County** - Draft comments are being addressed in the draft final report. USACE is to meet with LA County Beaches and Harbors on 28 January 2013 to discuss gathering public input through the city managers and public meeting in February
7. **Southern Monterey Bay SCOUP/Environmental Study**
  - a. DBW and AMBAG working through final language to transfer CRSMP to City of Monterey
  - b. DBW and City of Monterey working through language issues
  - c. PWA and Noble standing by waiting to initiate their respective work efforts

### C: Computer-based Tools

1. **WebMapper/GIS**
  - a. GIS database - LA, Eureka and Orange County RSM deliverables have been incorporated
  - b. Webmapper website development - updates are currently being incorporated
2. **CSMW Website**
  - a. Minor update activities
3. **CSMW Reference Database**
  - a. No new activities - site is publically accessible through the CSMW homepage

### D: Educational Documents

1. **Biological Impact Analysis Phase 2:**
  - a. OST Review- As of yesterday, SCC (Mary Small) has advised that they cannot take on the peer review effort. Their attorney has concluded that the work should be contracted out through standard contracting procedures.



## CSMW ATTENDEES

Name	Organization	E-mail
Steve Aceti	CALCOAST	<a href="mailto:SteveAceti@calcoast.org">SteveAceti@calcoast.org</a>
Brian Brennan	BEACON	<a href="mailto:Brian.Brennan@ventura.org">Brian.Brennan@ventura.org</a>
Jessica BurtonEvans	USACE – SF	<a href="mailto:Jessica.L.BurtonEvans@usace.army.mil">Jessica.L.BurtonEvans@usace.army.mil</a>
Clif Davenport	CGS	<a href="mailto:Clif.Davenport@conservation.ca.gov">Clif.Davenport@conservation.ca.gov</a>
John Dingler	USACE – SF	<a href="mailto:John.R.Dingler@usace.army.mil">John.R.Dingler@usace.army.mil</a>
Lesley Ewing	CCC	<a href="mailto:lewing@coastal.ca.gov">lewing@coastal.ca.gov</a>
Sarah Flores	CA OPC	<a href="mailto:SFlores@scc.ca.gov">SFlores@scc.ca.gov</a>
Kristin Goodrich	TRNERR	<a href="mailto:KGoodrich@parks.ca.gov">KGoodrich@parks.ca.gov</a>
Jim Haussener	CMANC	<a href="mailto:Jim@cmanc.com">Jim@cmanc.com</a>
Mark Johnsson	CCC	<a href="mailto:MJohnsson@coastal.ca.gov">MJohnsson@coastal.ca.gov</a>
Phil King	SFSU	<a href="mailto:pgking@sfsu.edu">pgking@sfsu.edu</a>
Susie Ming	USACE-LA	<a href="mailto:Susan.M.Ming@usace.army.mil">Susan.M.Ming@usace.army.mil</a>
Chris Potter	CA Resources	<a href="mailto:Chris.Potter@resources.ca.gov">Chris.Potter@resources.ca.gov</a>
Heather Schlosser	USACE – LA	<a href="mailto:Heather.R.Schlosser@usace.army.mil">Heather.R.Schlosser@usace.army.mil</a>
Kim Sterrett	CA DBW	<a href="mailto:Sterrett@dbw.ca.gov">Sterrett@dbw.ca.gov</a>
Jon Warrick	USGS	<a href="mailto:JWarrick@usgs.gov">JWarrick@usgs.gov</a>
Eric Wilkins	CA DFG	<a href="mailto:EWilkins@dfg.ca.gov">EWilkins@dfg.ca.gov</a>
Tamara Williams	GGNRA - NPS	<a href="mailto:tamara_williams@nps.gov">tamara_williams@nps.gov</a>
Alyssa Moore	USACE-SF	<a href="mailto:Alyssa.King@usace.army.mil">Alyssa.King@usace.army.mil</a>
Nancy Ferris	USACE-SF	<a href="mailto:Nancy.M.Ferris@usace.army.mil">Nancy.M.Ferris@usace.army.mil</a>
Gerald Comati	BEACON	<a href="mailto:comati@beacon.ca.gov">comati@beacon.ca.gov</a>
Jenny Jacox	BCDC	<a href="mailto:jennyj@bccdc.ca.gov">jennyj@bccdc.ca.gov</a>