

# Coastal Sediment Management Workgroup Meeting Minutes

(Meeting Minutes in Blue)

November 19, 2014

Location: USACE, 1455 Market Street, Lobby Conference Room, San Francisco, CA

Toll Free Number: (888) 431-3632

Web Meeting Address: <https://www.webmeeting.att.com>

Access Code (for phone and webmeeting): 8573291

9:35 Welcome and introductions (George Domurat and Chris Potter)

9:40 Review of action items (James Zoulas/Heather Schlosser)

- **Action Item: Sea Grant fellows to attend upcoming CSMW meetings** Done
- **Action Item: Clif to send a letter to Caltrans to consider RSM in upcoming project at Gleason's Beach.** Done, signed by Chris Potter and George D. **Contact Dale Jones (Caltrans), who is the Caltrans rep to CSMW.** Chris to continue coordination with CALTRANS.
- **General question: should there be a formalized review process for RSM plans?**
  - The plans need review, but need to have a product for the public by the Feb 2015 timeframe. Do Out - John D and USACE to discuss internal review process.
  - Any additional review beyond the public process?
  - Independent peer review process? (Brian R)
  - There was no external peer review process on previous plans, which used internal review and public workshops (Susie M). There was also a discussion of bigger state-wide plan, and the intention for USACE IWR to develop a main report for the entire state (Susie M).
  - Lesley E pointed out that a review does not necessarily mean that CCC and other agencies necessarily endorse a given RSM plan.
  - It was also pointed out that the BIA went through peer review through the Ocean Science Trust.
  - Chris P. encouraged group to volunteer to review RSM plans. Eureka, San Francisco, Santa Cruz, SLO still need to be completed.
  - *Lesley E asked if CSMW can we have 2 independent reviewers contracted to review outstanding RSM plans? (To be discussed at Jan 21, 2015 meeting?)*
  - Susie M noted that the LA Coast of CA study has been funded.
  - Do Out – Call for CSMW members to volunteer to review RSM plans and other products.
- **Action Item: Breda Goeden will send out the new white paper (CCC, State of Washington, BCDC) that addresses interactions between coastal structures and sediment.**
  - Done. Perhaps a presentation at a future meeting.
- **Action Item: A discussion of the new CCC sea level rise document should be added to the agenda of an upcoming CSMW meeting.**
  - Done.

10:00 Update: Coastal RSM Plan workshops (Chris Potter/Heather Schlosser)

Discussion was tabled?

## 10:15 Presentation: SF Bay RSM Effort (Brenda Goeden, BCDC)

- Introduction and Overview
  - RSM plan focuses on sandy beaches in SF Bay
  - Overview of SF Bay System
  - BCDC Sediment Management Team
  - Partnerships with many agencies
  - Description of physical processes, built environment, agencies, history
  - Recent research from USGS has shown a decline in sediment input to SF Bay, and erosion of the ebb tide delta and sections of SF Bay
  - Baylands Habitat Goals – recognizes importance of developing RSM plan.
- 5 Management Key Focus Areas
  - Watershed management
  - Habitat restoration and maintenance
  - Dredging and aggregate mining
  - Flood and shoreline protection
  - Climate change.
- Sediment
  - USGS is still processing new data on fine grain sediment
  - Goal is to develop an understanding of sediment sources and sinks
  - There is about 80% out of bay disposal under dredging practices.
- Discussion of dredging and beneficial reuse
  - Should we put sediment back into SF Bay to address current erosion? (John D).
  - There is a need for further work to determine if it is appropriate to place sediment in bay as proposed by the “feeding the mudflats” research effort. USACE can only pay for “cheapest” disposal option (Brian R).
  - LTMS considers beneficial reuse in marshes as keeping the material “in bay”
- Sand Mining
  - There are no good sand stockpile areas in SF Bay area.
  - Increase in import of sand (for high strength concrete) from BC.
  - BCDC will present proposed sand mining recommendations for Commission in Jan/Feb 2015.
  - There is a considerable data gap regarding biological resources in sand mining area. SLC did a benthic study but it did not capture immediate impacts of sand mining.
- Flood Control 2.0 – this is a joint study with EPA, and SFEI, which includes 3 pilot projects at Novato Creek, Walnut Creek, and San Francisquito Creek.
- San Francisco Bay Beaches (Anniken L.)
  - Used Peter Baye’s beach classification scheme
  - Length greater than 25 m, beach width greater than 5 m
  - Beach surveys – 2 in each region (12 total), includes sand samples (different grain sizes)
  - Few beaches have dune systems
  - Many small pocket beaches
  - Wide range of foreshore slopes (e.g., reflective vs dissipative)
  - Further work – shoreline change analysis (needs funding)
- Outreach activities for Central Bay (Pascal S.)
  - Marin, San Francisco, Alameda, Contra Costa Counties, East Bay Regional Parks
  - RSM and Bay Sediment Posters, shoreline maps, sand samples, surveys
  - 48 participants (35% responded to online surveys)
  - Main Concerns: regulatory requirements, improve coordination, more information on sediment and contaminants, tracking of sediment patterns, source of sediment build up in flood control channels, streamline permitting

- Next steps - analysis of county comments, summary of results, creation of GIS layers, stakeholder follow up
- Question about criteria for SF Bay BECAs (Tom K)
  - BCDC talked to local agencies. Question of who is “sediment manager”? (Brenda G)
  - Sandy beaches are usually part of a park system
- Beach nourishment in SF Bay
  - Crown Beach restoration – high cost of \$24 per cy
  - Aramburu Island
  - Ocean Beach
  - Antioch Dunes
  - Overview of potential sand sources
- Driver and ability analysis
- Questions
  - Chris Hewitt can provide information to Phil K on sand mining royalty fees and lease.
  - Chris P - how was Antioch Dunes funded? Partnership with Port of Stockton CDFG (USFWS?).
  - SF RSM Project timeframe – will be a continuing effort? Brenda G indicated that the Central Bay document will be completed by end of FY2015, with overall plan targeted for end of 2015 and early 2016.
  - Lesley E – any grain size analysis at Antioch dunes? The Antioch Dunes are comprised of finer sand, which likely was transported via wind. Dunes were harvested shortly after 1906 earthquake.

## **11:00 Presentation: SF Bay RSM Economics Study (Phil King, SF State)**

### Economic analysis for SF Bay CRSMP

- Any justification for nourishing beaches
- Collected recreational data
- There are at least several candidates for beach nourishment in the SF Bay.
  - Less material needed
  - Less erosion
- Methods
  - Inventory of amenities
  - Periodic counts
  - Estimate attendance and recreational activities
  - Estimated economic benefits with CSBAT
  - Estimated nourishment costs
- Amenities – informs economic value
- Importance of economic value of dog walking
- Benefit/Cost Ratios
  - Very high for McNears, Crown, Albany Bulb beaches
  - Worth taking a look at McNears
- Need more primary data on recreational activity inside the Bay.
- Question
  - What about role of kayaking? (Lesley E, Brenda G) – Not explicitly addressed, although it could impact beach attendance.
  - What about using USACE sand for in-Bay beach nourishment? Who would pay for cost above Federal standard? (John D). Suggestion to place sand at McNears Beach (Anniken D)
  - USACE can technically allow up to half of the benefits to be recreational (Tom K).

- BCDC will start looking at bay fill policies with respect to climate change adaptations (Project of Special Merit). The timeline for this project is sometime in the next 5 years.

## 11:45 Updates and announcements

- **Federal agencies**

- USACE –
  - Eureka - public meeting early in the month, run by David Cannon. Reviewed final draft, and will post draft public meeting scheduled in several months. Several of the recommendations in plan (e.g., purchasing of dredge) had already been done. John D talked to Crescent City harbor master, not a large enough area for a RSM plan, but maybe CSMW can help (John D).
  - Santa Cruz CRSMP: The remaining sections of the draft CRSMP should be completed in the next month or so, and the team met on Nov 18 to start drafting recommendations for the Santa Cruz CRSMP. Brad Damitz is still working with MBNMS staff regarding regulations with respect to beach nourishment activities. Brad's contract runs out in February, so it is important to release a draft of the plan ASAP before any upcoming stakeholder or public meetings. The contractor (Noble Consultants) has completed a draft of the Economic Considerations section of the CRSMP (James Z)
  - Elkhorn Slough – Brian R pointed out that there was a serious issue with the USACE Regulatory Branch regarding this project, issues with conversion of mud flats to tidal wetlands (Brian Ross). Brian asked Tom to follow up with Regulatory. **Do Out – Tom to follow up with USACE Regulatory regarding Elkhorn Slough.**
  - Surfers Beach (North Half Moon Bay) – Tom K reported on a recent meeting with San Mateo County Supervisor Horsley. The primary issue is figuring out how to place sand given MBNMS regulations. USACE is also trying to figure out what sort of report would be most useful, and looking into whether material removed from boat ramp can be placed on Surfers Beach.
  - Encinitas/Solana Beach – Heather S reported that SPL is working on a final Chiefs Report package which includes a smaller plan. The package was signed by the SPL commander and sent to SPD on 17 November (Schlosser).
  - Malibu – Susie M reported that SPL is still working through an analysis of placement of impounded sand on the beach, and hopes to have a Chiefs Report ready by Dec 2015. Susie also noted that first Malibu Technical Advisory Committee meeting will be on 20 November (Ming)
- USGS – John W. noted that the USGS started Santa Cruz area surveys this week.
- EPA – Brian R. reported on the recent meeting of ocean dumping coordinators in DC. Within EPA, and noted that there was not enough of a focus on beneficial reuse of sediments. Brian commended CSMW for being “ahead of the game”
- There was also discussion about an upcoming National RSM meeting with different Fed agencies, which has been tentatively for March in Jacksonville, FL.

- **State agencies**

- CCC - Broad Beach to go to CCC in December.
- State Lands - Broad Beach hearing scheduled for December 17. Team should follow up with Jason Ramos.

- **NGOs**

- CA Coastal Coalition (Steve A) - SANDAG Shoreline Preservation Group has cancelled last several quarterly meetings. There is a need to for CA DBW to get involved, and Chris Potter will

help Steve Aceti work on it. The CA legislature recently signed a bill to create a state-wide database (OPC) of sea level rise.

- Tom K also mentioned that USACE will be working on document to summarize sea level rise planning efforts in SF Bay. The effort is funded for FY15, but will likely require additional funding.
- Brian R mentioned that the EPA Region 9 Water Priority will be SF Bay

**12:15 Confirm date, location, and agenda for future meetings**

- Next Call – Dec 17
- Next Meeting – Jan 21
- **Schedule for public meetings (Susie Ming)**
  - Santa Cruz - Jan 15
- **Topics for future CSMW meetings (Chris Potter)**
  - Discussion of lessons learned from public workshops (Dec 17)
  - Elhwa Dam (John W)
  - North Coast Plan
  - Doug George's headland research
  - East Bay Regional Parks
  - West Coast Governor's Report on coastal hazards
  - Netherlands (H. Schlosser)
  - Gary Greene and sea floor mapping

**12:30 Adjourn**

**Note: Materials will be posted on the CSMW ftp site prior to the meeting:**  
<ftp://ftp.dbw.ca.gov/CSMW%20Presentations/>

## CSMW ATTENDEES

November 19, 2014

Name	Organization	Email
Steve Aceti	California Coastal Coalition	<a href="mailto:Steveaceti@calcoast.org">Steveaceti@calcoast.org</a>
John Dingler	USACE-SPN	<a href="mailto:John.R.Dingler@usace.army.mil">John.R.Dingler@usace.army.mil</a>
Lesley Ewing	CCC	<a href="mailto:lewing@coastal.ca.gov">lewing@coastal.ca.gov</a>
Brenda Goeden	BCDC	<a href="mailto:BrendaG@bcdc.ca.gov">BrendaG@bcdc.ca.gov</a>
Chris Hewitt	CA State Lands	
Tom Kendall	USACE-SPN	<a href="mailto:Thomas.R.Kendall@usace.army.mil">Thomas.R.Kendall@usace.army.mil</a>
Phil King	SF State	<a href="mailto:pgking@sfsu.edu">pgking@sfsu.edu</a>
Anniken Lydon	BCDC	<a href="mailto:Anniken.Lydon@bcdc.ca.gov">Anniken.Lydon@bcdc.ca.gov</a>
Mary Matella	CCC	<a href="mailto:Mary.matella@coastal.ca.gov">Mary.matella@coastal.ca.gov</a>
Susie Ming	USACE-SPL	<a href="mailto:Susan.M.Ming@usace.army.mil">Susan.M.Ming@usace.army.mil</a>
Alyssa Moore	USACE	<a href="mailto:Alyssa.Moore@usace.army.mil">Alyssa.Moore@usace.army.mil</a>
Chris Potter	CA Resources	<a href="mailto:Chris.Potter@resources.ca.gov">Chris.Potter@resources.ca.gov</a>
Brian Ross	US EPA	<a href="mailto:Ross.Brian@epa.gov">Ross.Brian@epa.gov</a>
Pascale Soumoy	BCDC	<a href="mailto:Pascale.soumoy@bcdc.ca.gov">Pascale.soumoy@bcdc.ca.gov</a>
Heather Schlosser	USACE-SPL	<a href="mailto:Heather.R.Schlosser@usace.army.mil">Heather.R.Schlosser@usace.army.mil</a>
John Warrick	USGS	<a href="mailto:JWarrick@usgs.gov">JWarrick@usgs.gov</a>
James Zoulas	USACE-SPN	<a href="mailto:James.G.Zoulas@usace.army.mil">James.G.Zoulas@usace.army.mil</a>